



Canada



MON/18/101: Towards a professional and citizen-centered civil service in Mongolia

ANNUAL PROGRESS REPORT

1 January – 31 December 2019

Project snapshot

Period covered by this report:	1 January – 31 December 2019
Project ID:	MON/18/101
Project Title:	Towards a professional and citizen-centered civil service in Mongolia
Project Start Date:	14 February 2018
Project End Date:	31 December 2022
Implementing Partner:	Civil Service Council of Mongolia
Responsible Parties:	
Funding sources:	Government of Canada US \$5,400,000 UNDP US \$100,000 Total: US \$5,500,000
<p>Brief Project Description and Outputs: This project aims to support the reform of the Mongolian civil service, to create a stable, impartial, professional and citizen-centered institution. This will be achieved by implementing the necessary legal and policy reforms to support a professional civil service, building the professional skills of civil servants through training, enhancing gender equality in the public sector and improving government service delivery and accountability.</p> <p>Outputs:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Strengthened legal and policy framework for a professional civil service 2. Improved professional capacities of civil servants 3. Enhanced gender equality in public administration, and 4. Citizen-centred monitoring of public administration performance. 	
Budget 2019	US \$1,604,880.00
Expenditure 2019	US \$1,253,931.65
Delivery %	78%
UNDP contact person	Elaine Conkievich Resident Representative, UNDP Mongolia Email: elaine.conkievich@undp.org@undp.org Tel: 976-317585 (1111)

CONTENT

Project snapshot	2
1. Context analysis	5
2. Overview of key achievements in 2019	10
3. Project performance and results	11
Output 1. Strengthened legal and policy framework for a professional civil service.....	11
Output 2. Improved professional capacities for civil servants.....	15
Output 3. Enhanced gender equality in public administration	19
Output 4. Citizen-centred monitoring of public administration performance	22
4. Project management	23
5. Update on risks and issues	25
Annex	27

Abbreviations

CSC	Civil Service Council
CSL	Civil Service Law
CPSC	Canadian Public Service Commission
CSOs	Civil society organizations
GAC	Global Affairs Canada
HR	Human resources
HRM	Human resource management
IAAC	Independent Authority against Corruption
IPAC	Institute of Public Administration Canada
JD	Job descriptions
LKYSPP	Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy, Singapore
MERIT	“Mongolia: Enhancing Resource Management through Institutional Transformation” project
NAOG	National Academy of Governance
NCGE	National Committee on Gender Equality
NHRC	National Human Rights Commission
NUM	National University of Mongolia
SCSS	Standing Committee on State Structure, Parliament of Mongolia
SDGs	Sustainable Development Goals
SOE	State-owned enterprise
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme

1. Context analysis

Changes in legislative, policy and institutional environment - 2019

- Constitutional amendments were adopted in November 2019 after years of debating. One of the amendments limits the number of Cabinet members who can concurrently hold MP posts to five, including the Prime Minister (Art.39.1)¹. This provision aims to strengthen the accountability of the executive and the oversight role of the Parliament.
- One of the proposals for constitutional amendment was to include a provision on upholding of merit principle and prohibition of dismissal of civil servants after the elections. The proposal did not get support in the Parliament during deliberations on constitutional amendment.
- The Law on Parliamentary Elections approved in 2019 introduced a new provision prohibiting people who have committed corruption and abuse of power crime from running in elections (Art 29.8)².
- The Law on Parliamentary Elections (2019) did not raise gender quota for candidates; the gender quota remains at minimum of 20% of candidates (Art 30.2). The Law on Elections of Aimag, Capital City, Soum, and District Councils (2020) newly introduced 20% gender quota for candidates (Art 29.2)³. Given there was no gender quota in previous local elections, this is an important step forward towards gender equality at local decision-making.
- The Government of Mongolia drafted “Vision-2050”, a long-term development policy document, in 2019, taking stock of developments and lessons learned of past 30 years and outlining development objectives for the next 30 years. The draft has been submitted to the Parliament and due to be discussed during the 2020 Spring Session. This is a very comprehensive document and how it will be translated into medium-term policy documents and the Government Action Plan will have some implications for the Project as they would be the basis for organizational strategic and performance plans.
- The “Code of Ethics of Administrative and Service Category Civil Servants” was adopted in January 2019, by the Government Resolution No.33⁴. The Code prohibits workplace discrimination, harassment, sexual harassment. The Code was amended in April 2019, by the Government Resolution No.122, requiring civil servants to maintain diplomatic ethics while on overseas business travel, prohibiting gambling (casino) in overseas countries, consumption of alcohol in workplaces, and undue behavior in public places. These decisions and other cases, such as joint inspection of the CSC and the road police on use of work vehicles to take children to school, and the sexual harassment incident involving a high-ranking official provided examples of what code of ethics mean in real life and increased public scrutiny of the conduct of civil servants.
- “Procedure on Disciplinary Sanctions and Appeals for Core Civil Servants” was adopted by the Joint decree No.34/32 of the Chief of Cabinet Secretariat and the Chair of the Civil Service Council in April 2019⁵. Pursuant to relevant provisions of the Civil Service Law, the procedure envisages disciplinary measures from warning to dismissal without the right to join the civil service for a period of 3 years.

¹ <https://www.legalinfo.mn/law/details/367>

² <https://www.legalinfo.mn/law/details/14869>

³ <https://www.legalinfo.mn/law/details/15125?lawid=15125>

⁴ <https://www.legalinfo.mn/annex/details/9237?lawid=14044>

⁵ <http://www.csc.gov.mn/s/30/481>

- The Civil Service Law (2017) provides that costs incurred due to unlawful dismissal of civil servants shall be borne by the person who made that decision. This is a new provision which aims to strengthen the accountability of decision-makers of government entities and to prevent unlawful dismissal of civil servants. However, according to the CSC, the amount of compensation paid by the government for unlawful dismissal remains very high. The CSC undertook several measures to introduce the mechanisms for implementation of this provision and concluded that grievance handling will be a priority in the coming years.
- “The Procedure on cash bonus for civil servants” was adopted in 2019 by the Government Resolution No.5. The bonus is to be provided based on performance results and in accordance with the Civil Service Law (Art 51.1.4) and the amount of quarterly bonus should not exceed 40% of monthly salary. This procedure provides some incentive for promoting performance culture in the civil service.
- The total number of civil servants as of January 2018⁶ was 192,475 (all categories). The trend of increasing number of civil servants has not been reversed in 2019. It has been estimated that the number goes up to around 240,000, if employees of state-owned enterprises are added.
7
- Civil servants constitute around 10% of the total workforce in Mongolia, and the government remains as the largest employer (TBC). The retirement age was raised to 65 in 2018, but the increase is being applied gradually by adding three months a year. This will have implications on workforce age structure.
- In 2019, the composition of the Civil Service Council was renewed, following the CSL provision to increase the number of Members of the CSC from three to five. In view of the entry into force of the CSL, the number of Secretariat staff was increased to 39, an increase of more than two-fold.
- The Cabinet Secretariat established a new department in charge of public sector human resource policy and coordination. The department has not been operationalized yet as of December 2019
- Two more agencies were created in 2019, making the total number of agencies 45 compared to 40 when the new government approved its organizational structure. Organizational re-structuring has been one of the main justifications for new hiring and dismissals, hence, the Civil Service Law prohibited the change in job descriptions unless the mandate of the organization has been changed by law. Therefore, the CSC tracks the number of agencies to prevent from risks of undue staff turnover.
- The revised Law on National Human Rights Commission was adopted in January 2020⁸. The number of Commissioners was increased from three to five, and Art 12.9 specifically provides that when appointing Commissioners gender of candidates should be considered and 40% gender quota shall be applied. This is a commendable progress and a precedent for organizations reporting to the Parliament, including CSC which also consists of five Members.
- National Academy of Governance (NAOG) was formally designated as the civil service training institution in December 2018.

⁶ 2019 CSC Annual Report will be publicly available in April 2020

⁷ <https://www.legalinfo.mn/law/details/383>

⁸ <https://www.legalinfo.mn/law/details/15152?lawid=15152>

- In 2019, the whole process of registration, testing and marking of general examination was organized online, the first time since the CSC has started civil service general examination decades ago.
- Initial steps to link the CSC human resource database with the Ministry of Finance payroll system has been piloted, under the Ministry of Finance/World Bank project.

Monitoring changes in legal, policy, and institutional environment assists the Project in evaluating the overall progress of the civil service reform, making sense of emerging trends, identifying key interventions and communications strategies.

Update on the overall civil service reform process⁹

Civil service reform is a major undertaking. One year on from the new Civil Service Law coming into effect, civil service reform is progressing well. By the end of 2019, most of the regulations have already been put in place and have been applied by the CSC, Cabinet Secretariat and other respective government entities. Below is an update on key focus areas of the reform;

- The main priority and the central piece of the reform is to reduce politicization of civil service appointments and high turnover. This objective is being achieved through i) standardisation of job descriptions (prohibiting change in JDs unless organizational mandate is changed by law), ii) introducing mandatory years of service for promotions, iii) allowing the appointing authority to refuse the selected candidate only once with due legal justifications, and iv) reforming the examination. Around 70% of job descriptions have been approved by the CSC and recruitments since the approval, all recruitments followed the new requirements. There has been no case in 2019 where the appointing authority refused to appoint the selected candidate. There have been cases where no candidate was selected. Complete data by different categories have not been finalized as of end 2019, and once finalized, these data would provide fuller picture on where the gaps are and where the implementation needs to be strengthened.

After this initial round of streamlining the current pool of job descriptions, further work would be required to strengthen job classifications to serve the objective of building a professional civil service that is 'fit for purpose', and also to support the career-based promotion through expanded pool of eligible candidates.

- The CSC and Cabinet Secretariat have been collaborating throughout 2019, with each of them raising their legitimate concerns, finding common ground to proceed based on practical solutions of individual cases, and clarifying the division of labour.
- Considerable progress has been in reforming the civil service examination content and administration. However, a lot more needs to be done in future years to align it with international good practices and tune to emerging needs for professionalization, including ability of civil servants to respond modern day challenges.

Next, more challenging has been the implementation strategic planning and performance management. Only few organizations have developed their strategic plan as it takes time, and analysis of strategic plan components, indicators used and process applied is being done, to update the methodology.

⁹ This section is prepared based on internal evaluation of the Project only. Additional information can be found in the international consultant's report "Taking stock of implementation of civil service reform in Mongolia" (Dec 2019)

Overall, public scrutiny of appointments of high-level officials has increased, which provides additional support to implementation of the CSL. The Independent Authority against Corruption (IAAC) has developed a search system opendatalab.mn, providing integrated information on asset and income declaration, state registration, mining licenses, and election data. This website aims to provide an easy-to-use access of government information to general public, CSOs and the media.

In addition to strengthening implementation efforts, there are areas where legislative changes and revision of existing regulations are needed. For example, a legal provision which deters candidates with conflict of interest issues as concluded by the IAAC from being appointed was repealed by an amendment to the Law on Regulation of Public and Private Interest in Public Service, and Prevention from Conflict of Interest (2012), which was adopted in 2017 and came into force in 2019.

Overall, a good progress was made in implementing the civil service reform in 2019, albeit the extent of progress has been varied for different thematic streams of reform components.

Underlying political context. The Civil Service Law (2017) introduced merit-based, career-based system of promotion, which means that it would be impossible for people to join the civil service at middle and high-level positions. During the Constitutional amendment deliberations at the Parliament in September 2019, individual MPs expressed their strong views against career-based system, as the principle is leaving young, capable professionals out of civil service¹⁰. The proposal to include in the Constitution a provision ‘Core civil service shall be professional, stable, ethical, accountable, and be based on merit principle, with independent oversight. Core civil servants shall not be dismissed on the grounds other than those specified in laws’ did not pass the required threshold. If passed, this provision would have made it hard to amend the Civil Service Law.

This is the key underlying political issue which accompany the civil service reform. Therefore, the Parliamentary elections of 2020 is an important factor for future trajectory of the reform.

Underlying institutional context. While within the prerogatives of existing legislations, institutional context is also an important factor to consider for successful roll-out of the reform. The main institutions leading the reform process are Civil Service Council, Cabinet Secretariat, Parliamentary Standing Committee on State Structure (SCSS), and line ministries and agencies. Administrative Court, Independent Authority against Corruption, National Human Rights Commission, National Academy of Governance, National Committee on Gender Equality, Ministry of Finance, and local governments.

Civil Service Council (CSC) has long overseen civil service human resource management, in the absence of equivalent coordinating agency under the executive government. With the adoption of the CSL and the subsequent establishment of HR unit at the Cabinet Secretariat, and as CSC assumes more active HR audit role, more implementation related responsibilities are being shifted to Cabinet Secretariat. For example, promoting hard to fill in posts in rural areas would be the responsibility of respective Governor’s Office, under the overall management of the Cabinet Secretariat. Civil servants’ database has been maintained by the CSC and is accessible only by the CSC, and the discussions are underway on creating an integrated and expanded database with multiple agencies, including Cabinet Secretariat, accessing their respective modules.

Cabinet Secretariat is in good position to coordinate civil service reform and HR management, with other government priorities, including intersectoral policy coherence, development policy and planning, and strategic planning and performance benchmarks. Recent initiatives by the Cabinet Secretariat, including enforcement of ethical code of conduct and unequivocal dismissal of civil servants who were involved in serious breach of the code, received broad public support.

¹⁰ <http://www.parliament.mn/n/6mjv>

Parliamentary Standing Committee on State Structure (SCSS) is a key institution for maintaining political support for the reform. CSC submits its annual report to the Parliament. Main operational procedures of the CSC, including its bylaw, were approved by the Parliament.

The CSC is building its partnership with the National Committee on Gender Equality (NCGE), in mainstreaming gender in civil service rules and regulations.

Ministry of Finance is an important stakeholder of the civil service reform, as the civil service payroll is a factor for maintaining long-term competitiveness vis-à-vis other employers. The Project has not engaged with the Ministry of Finance in the first two years of its implementation but has been in contact with the World Bank regarding their strategies in this respect.

Overall, institutional dynamics of stakeholders in relation to civil service reforms for the first year of CSL implementation has showed that each of the government organizations has fulfilled their legal mandates. Ensuring consistency across organizations and taking a more aligned and integrated approach through joint actions in 2020 would give a stronger signal of reform commitment, to civil servants, the general public and politicians. Thus, the year 2020 is a key milestone on delivering and communicating intermediate results the civil service reforms are expected to bring.

2. Overview of key achievements in 2019

The year 2019 was a landmark year for many aspects of the civil service reform in Mongolia. Working closely with key partners, the Project contributed to achievement of the following results:

Standardized job descriptions. The greatest loophole that was distorting the merit principle was arbitrary changes in job descriptions which had allowed people with inadequate qualifications join the civil service legally. Over 70% of job descriptions were screened and approved by the CSC in 2019 and new recruitments have been following the newly approved job descriptions. The research studies on job descriptions, takeaway messages from study tours, training workshops for CSC chapters and aimag working groups on job descriptions, and inputs and comments of international consultants, facilitated by the Project, contributed to this result.

Design of the test pool of civil service entrance examination. The first civil service general (entrance) examination under the new CSL was conducted in 2019. By revamping test pool, the Project is contributing to the shift from testing theoretical legal knowledge and ability to memorize to testing competencies and analytic capacities. New sets of test questions were developed by the Project, covering 5 areas, including problem solving, analytic capacity, teamwork, management and leadership capabilities. The Project also facilitated an analytic review of the current pool, translation of a set of test questions of other countries and sharing of lessons learned from overseas civil service testing systems. Building local expertise in development of test questions remains a priority for the Project.

Package professionalization training. Civil service trainings have been made mandatory and pre-requisite for promotion for the first time in Mongolia by the new CSL. A total of 29 modules were developed with the Project support and delivered by NAOG to around 73% of all civil servants who are required to complete the professionalization training. In 2019, the Project facilitated this outcome by reviewing and providing comments on the draft syllabi and teaching methods for quality assurance, inviting guest lecturers to share experience sharing with NAOG professors, translating reference books, and organizing content validation trainings.

Mainstreaming gender. Progress was made in 2019 by the Project in mainstreaming gender in civil service and promotion of gender equality in public administration. A baseline study on gender equality in administrative civil service provided a snapshot of gender parity across categories, positions and locations. Some of the recommendations of the study have already been reflected in the CSC 2020 workplan. Trainings on gender and human rights contributed to improved awareness of gender concerns among civil servants in selected aimags, as evidenced by the findings of the baseline study. Advocacy intervention against sexual harassment was conducted leveraging the momentum when the issue was under public attention involving a high-level Mongolian public official.

Human resource audit manual. With support from the project, for the first time in Mongolia civil service, a human resource audit manual has been developed. The manual will provide a tool for CSC to carry out its oversight role over human resources processes but also contribute to capacity building of human resource officers at central and sub-national government organizations.

Civil service law advocacy. In cooperation with the key partners, the Project provided a platform for discussions, exchange of opinions, constructive communications among CSC, Cabinet Secretariat, NAOG, top level managers and civil servants, through different avenues, including extensive field trips to the regions. Such communications aim to contribute to better understanding of specific steps being taken towards civil service reform, greater ownership and trust among civil servants.

3. Project performance and results

This is the second annual project report prepared for this project. It covers the period from 1 January to 31 December 2019.

Output 1. Strengthened legal and policy framework for a professional civil service

Indicator(s):	Baseline:	Targets:	Update for 2019 (Year 2):
1.1 Turnover rate of civil servants after the elections.	14.23 ¹¹ %	7.6% (Year 4)	To be updated by the end of 2020
1.2 Percentage of acceptance of recommendations from analytical studies supported by the project at the policy level.	n/a	80% (Year 4)	On track. Numerous recommendations have been incorporated in regulations recently approved ¹² .

1.1. Most regulations required by the Civil Service Law were finalized and approved

Building on the strong groundwork of 2018, the Project continued to provide technical support to both the CSC and the Cabinet Secretariat in conceptualizing and finalizing the draft regulations provided for in the CSL. Below is a list of procedures/regulations approved in 2019, all of which had received support from the Project:

- Procedure on developing, approving and implementing strategic plan¹³;
- Procedure for developing business plan of organization, establishment of performance targets and indicators, and reporting¹⁴;
- Procedure for developing annual performance plan of core civil servants, establishment of performance targets and indicators, reporting, assessment of performance results and the level of qualifications¹⁵;
- Generic procedure on developing specific requirements for managerial and executive positions of the core civil service¹⁶
- Ethical norms of civil servants holding public service and public administration positions¹⁷
- Procedure for maintaining integrated register of civil servants, including retrieval of information¹⁸
- Procedure for imposing disciplinary sanctions and related appeals¹⁹
- Procedure for transfer and rotation of civil servants to another positions²⁰

In 2019, the Project assisted CSC with the drafting of these procedures and prepared a list of proposed measures for putting the procedures into practice. The Project also provided technical inputs for developing operational procedures of the CSC Secretariat²¹.

¹¹ The baseline is being validated with the CSC.

¹² A detailed list of recommendations accepted and rejected will be available by June 2020.

¹³ GoM resolution # 36 of 2019

¹⁴ GoM resolution #37 of 2019

¹⁵ GoM resolution #38 of 2019

¹⁶ CSC Decree #3 of 2019

¹⁷ GoM Resolution #33 of 2019

¹⁸ GoM Resolution #74 of 2019

¹⁹ Joint Decree by Chief of Cabinet Secretariat and the Chair of CSC #36/32 of 2019

²⁰ Joint Decree by Chief of Cabinet Secretariat and the Chair of the CSC #34/31 of 2019

²¹ List of proposed measures for implementing CSL, Project Consultant's Report, 2019 (in Mongolian)

Developing these procedures was a major work which involved identification of key issues to tackle, weighing up different policy options and dilemmas, building consensus, and checking if the proposed versions serve the purpose of the civil service reform goals.

The approval of these procedures contributed to creating an enabling environment for timely implementation of the requirements set forth by the CSL and to maintain the reform pace.

Given the vast scope of the reform, the scale/depth of conceptual changes that some of these procedures intend to introduce, and the changing environment both at the national and local levels, the Project will continue to collaborate with the key stakeholders to further improve the quality of the procedures. This includes collecting feedback on practicality and user-friendliness and analyzing the effectiveness of specific procedures in reaching the intended outcomes. For example, introducing results-based performance culture in the civil service through strategic planning document as a tool requires continuous technical support.

1.2. A baseline study on gender equality in the civil service was conducted

The baseline study on gender equality in the administrative civil service (2019) provided a snapshot of gender parity by different categories, posts and location, revealed several critical areas and provided an extensive list of recommendations to duty bearers. Thus, around 60.4% of all civil servants are women, indicating a high level of participation of women. However, the percentage of women in decision-making levels is low with women holding only 26.6% of posts equivalent to head of department of ministries. More detailed findings can be seen from the study which is in the final stages of publication.

The study revealed almost a total neglect of the gender quota provisions of the Gender Equality Law (2011) by respective government entities and the lack of enforcement mechanisms. The findings were presented on 9, 10 December 2019 at the training workshop of the CSC chapters in ministries, agencies and provinces, thereby sensitizing the key officials engaged in civil service personnel management of persistent gender issues and the immediate need to rectify the situation. This full-day session was the biggest event in recent years dedicated to gender equality in the civil service.

This study is one of the flagship reports produced with the Project support. The recommendations of the study, including mainstreaming gender in civil service rules and regulations will be taken into account in the Project's 2020 workplan. Some of the recommendations, including expanding the level of disaggregation in civil servants' database have already been included in the CSC workplan for 2020.

1.3. Civil servants' awareness of the new operating environment under the Civil Service Law and civil service reforms was raised

In 2018, the first round of awareness raising among civil servants was conducted with the baseline study to determine the preparedness for the entry into force of the new CSL and the conference on civil service reforms. In 2019, with the Project support, the CSC conducted another round of outreach campaign. 13 aimag CSC chapters have hosted five teams dispatched from CSC to assist them in incorporating legislation into their respective staffing plans, provide clarity on the dispute resolution mechanism, and strategize on capacity development of the staff. This mission stretching for 28 days and attended by 3,689 from 63 institutions monitored the fulfillment of four functions of the CSC Chapters: i) internal monitoring of compliance, ii) promotion of CSL, iii) appointment process and iv) resolution of complaints from citizens.

This assessment provided an insight to CSC on how to best direct its support and guidance to its Chapters. Furthermore, best practices of aimags, including the one implemented by Umnugovi –

online tracking of requests lodged by citizens,²² were then shared to other organizations for further uptake.

Questions raised during meetings with civil servants and managers were compiled into a Q&A booklet²³ and disseminated to all government units, including those in aimags and soums for reference.

1.4. Academic debates on key issues of civil service reform and innovation

“UB Impulse” public lecture is a traditional event of the School of International Relations and Public Administration, the National University of Mongolia (NUM), where renowned scholars and experts share emerging concepts on public administration. In 2019, the Project supported the 16th-18th of the series of lectures by Prof. Julian Dierkes, University of British Columbia on “*Resource profits, distributional justice and the unitary state*”. In addition to the usual crowd of civil servants, academia and the students, Prof Dierkes’ session drew interest from State owned enterprises, which constituted 20% of the attendees. The presenter’s observation that loosening of the unitary nature of the state in areas of policymaking related to mining was followed by questions of his thoughts on alternative policy interventions for more equitable re-distribution of resources.

Prof. Wojciech Federczyk, Poland’s Lech Kaczyński National School of Public Administration on “*Citizen-oriented public service*” and Prof Undram, NUM on “*Exponential growth of technology and Mongolian higher education policy*”²⁴. Prof Undram’s session was attended largely by female who were inspired by her lecture focus on Fourth Industrial revolution and potential for girls in STEM.

1.5. Learning from international experiences of civil service reform

With the CSL Mongolia has paved the foundation of the civil service reform and its key conceptual bases. However, there are numerous technical level tools, institutional mechanisms and innovative solutions where Mongolia needs to catch up with international good practices, while taking note of differences of the system in general.

CSC’s attendance to the 2019 UN Public Service Forum²⁵ in Azerbaijan has allowed CSC to engage in the discussion with other peer organizations on developing effective and inclusive public institutions for Agenda 2030. While still recognizing early days of the reform, peer institutions at the Forum have complimented Mongolia for making a strong commitment to the reform and encouraged Mongolia to continue to partake in this global discussion. The Forum had a comprehensive agenda, covering various aspects of the 2030 Agenda and the role of the civil service for each of the. The main takeaways from the Forum by the CSC participants include:²⁶

- The key relevance of SDG10 and 16 for the civil service and empowerment of civil servants in achieving the targets; and strategies and ways to mobilize and equip civil servants with the capacities to realize the 2030 Agenda;
- Innovations in public service delivery which can be introduced to Mongolian context, including sanitation solutions in low-income areas (Kenya), engaging public in waste management (Brazil), self-reliant solar energy community (Thailand), rabbit management community action (Australia) and one-stop service centre of Azerbaijan;

²² <http://urgudul.omnogovi.gov.mn/user/login>

²³ Annex

²⁴ <http://sirpa.num.edu.mn/web2/?p=82793>

²⁵ <https://publicadministration.un.org/en/UNPSA2019>

²⁶ Back to office report to CSC and Workshop report, 2019

- Innovative measures in the public sector for social inclusion of vulnerable groups and promoting gender responsive public service to achieve SDGs;

Charged with an immediate need to translate the CSL into Human Resource Management (HRM) policies that are based on the principles of meritocracy, a study visit to Canada study was organized in June 2019. Main takeaways were as follows²⁷:

- Link job descriptions with civil service pay scales and grades;
- Develop proposals on creation of senior managers' pool, recruitment and selection policies for the senior civil service in the central government, objective evaluation of the abilities and qualifications required for senior civil servants and competency assessment tools and techniques;
- Conduct trainings continuously, especially for human resource (HR) managers through HR development policies and institutions, continuing education credit system;
- Research and develop proposals on linking civil service pay scales with performance and results;
- Adapt and develop performance management system, benchmarking and KPIs of government institutions;
- Learn technological innovations in the civil service, including data based and paperless e-HRM system;
- Review again the competency requirements and develop proposals for revision of the approved procedure.

A notable experience of Canadian public service that can be applied in Mongolian civil service was setting up gender parity targets and linking it with performance of top executives.

Under the Memorandum of Understanding between the Cabinet Secretariat of Mongolia and the Ministry of Personnel Management of the Republic of South Korea signed on March 2019, a study visit was organized in October 2019, and main findings from the visit were as follows²⁸:

- The Republic of Korea introduced digital payroll system in 2013 which allowed automated disbursement of salaries and overtime pay, based on personnel information entered into the system. This has stopped any fraudulent actions related to salary. Mongolia has piloted such system in 2019, and its roll-out is expected to take place in 2020.
- "E-Saram", South Korea's HRM system consists of HR management sub-system and HR policy support sub-systems. The system contains all personnel related data of civil servants from the moment they enter the civil service till their retirement. HR policy sub-system allows generation of different HR related statistics and analyses and interacts with 130 other systems of 80 public organizations.
- Senior Executive Service was introduced in the civil service in 2006, to improve competitiveness based on productivity and performance.
- Competency assessments do not just evaluate past performance but also promote capabilities needed in the future. Detailed procedures on compositions of evaluation committees and scorings have been shared.
- E-learning system for civil servants was established in 2000, and the demand has since then increased. The final update made in 2017 offers programs for individual learning and development, including optional courses and links to other sources of learning such as Youtube. Over 1.7 mln civil servants in South Korea have enrolled in various courses over the past years.

²⁷ Report of the Canada study visit participants, 2019; Report of the Canada study tour by the host institution (IPAC), 2019

²⁸ Report of the study tour to Republic of Korea, November 2019

1.6. Progress of the ongoing reform strategies and processes was analyzed to inform decision-making and to identify follow-up actions

Despite the initiatives being taken towards modernization of the civil service, challenges remain. The analysis shows the importance of implementing and monitoring the approved procedures for keeping the reform momentum. Reinforcing political neutrality, protecting merit principle, continuously building ownership of reform among civil servants in general and middle-top level managers are the other priorities.

Output 2. Improved professional capacities for civil servants

Indicator(s):	Baseline: 2017	Targets:	Update for 2019 (Year 2):
2.1 Number of package professionalization training modules available for the administrative category of civil servants, excluding executive posts.	0	2 (Y1) 2 (Y2)	Achieved (29 modules for 4 categories of civil servants) ^{29*}
2.2 A set of mandatory online training courses on gender, prevention of harassment, sexual harassment, abuse of authority in the workplace, ethics and conflicts of interest introduced in the civil service.	0	2 (Y2)	On track (the content is developed, transfer to online is underway)
2.3 Completion rate of mandatory courses.	0	30% (Y2)	93% (senior principle officer) 87% (principle officer) 13% (senior officer)
2.4 Reform of entry examinations into the civil service.		1 (Y1)	On track (CSC approved the examination procedure)
2.5 Standard benchmark for fair, transparent and accountable HR processes established and monitored.	0		On track (CSC approved the procedure for career-based promotion; HR audit manual prepared)
2.6 Leadership training module developed and number of trainers trained.	1	30 (Y2)	The leadership training content is to be developed by NAOG in 2020 ³⁰
2.7 Number of middle and senior level civil servants received leadership training.	0	450 (Y2)	To be rolled out after the content is finalized.

2.1. Conceptualization and setting the foundation of HR audit

Human resources audit and inspection are one of the oversight functions that the new CSL assigned to the CSC. In the absence of local expertise and experience of HR audit in its classic concept, the CSC undertook a major work in 2019 laying down the conceptual basis of HR audit for the first time in Mongolia. A HR audit manual was produced with support from experts of the Institute of Public Administration of Canada (IPAC), based on the one that is in place with the Canadian Public Service Commission (CPSC) and associated coaching.

The Manual describes the HR audit methodology, explaining in broad terms how audits should be selected, planned, conducted and reported. The manual refers to various audit tools and other guidance, providing “how to” information. The purpose of the manual is to:

²⁹ From the feedback of participants and the professors developing the modules, it was agreed that priority modules from the four thematic areas of the Package Professionalization training needs continued development.

³⁰ Discussions to be held with MERIT project on building on the curriculum and training materials prepared and delivered by MERIT to senior level officers of selected Ministries and local governments.

- Provide guidance to auditors in complying with the HR audit policies;
- Assist auditors in achieving the highest possible quality in HR audits;
- Promote the highest level of professional competence in HR auditors;
- Provide a basis for measuring audit performance; and
- Allow others outside the HR Audit to gain a better perspective and understanding of the practices and professionalism of HR Audit.

The CSC acknowledges that as the civil service reform progresses, HR audit will be one of the main tools not only for fulfilling its oversight role but also for building HR capacity and procedural compliance in public sector organizations at national and sub-national levels.

2.2. First steps to revamp the content of civil service examination were made

In 2019, the CSC set up a designated unit to oversee general and special examinations and organized the first general examination under the CSL, making strides in revamping test pool, assessment and test administration.

With support of the Project, the test design shifts from testing theoretical legal knowledge and ability to memorize to testing competencies and analytic capacities. New sets of test questions were developed covering 5 areas, including problem solving, analytic capacity, teamwork, management and leadership capabilities, based on the review of the current pool and lessons learned from overseas civil service testing systems. In addition to further strengthening general examination testing, the Project will support the reforms of special examinations in 2020.

2.3. Job descriptions were standardized, preventing arbitrary modifications

In 2019, the CSC put tremendous efforts into fulfilling its obligation under Art 23.3 and 23.4 of the CSL on screening and approving job descriptions prepared by government organizations. Having learned about the Government of Canada's reform attempt of 2008-2009 during study visit in June 2019 and taking advantage of Mongolia's job classification structure being tied to pay scales, the CSC was able to approve 73.8% (14,036) of all job (position) descriptions. The standardization of job descriptions for each classification group enhances the CSC to take charge of oversight of recruitment and move away from fraudulent practice of changing the job descriptions to tailor to a preferred candidate's profile.

In August 2019, a two-day training workshop on developing job descriptions was organized with the Project support, for the aimag JD Working Groups. Through the practical work of filling in the templates, the participants gained first-hand experience in job analysis and preparing job descriptions while ensuring consistency across aimags and organizations and complying with the requirements set forth in the Common Procedures for Developing Job Descriptions (2019). Around 112 civil servants from 21 aimags (63) and the capital city districts (49) attended the workshop, of which 55% were women.

The workshop was organized jointly with the MERIT project, funded by the Global Affairs Canada (GAC). The MERIT project presentation on job analysis and job descriptions based on their pilot for aimag Governor's Office provided practical and contextualized insights and lessons learned.

2.4. The package professionalization training program was approved, and rolled out for top, middle level civil service managers

The CSL (2017) stipulated that civil service training policy and system should be in line with the requirement of civil service professionalization and career-based promotion. The Law also provided that civil service training to be delivered through a unified training system. As the package professional training was made mandatory for all civil servants, the year 2019 was critical for the NAOG, as the designated civil service training institution, to train incumbent civil servants.

The Package professionalization training curricula developed by NAOG with support of the Project was approved in April 2019³¹. The package consists of 29 modules; 9 modules designated for Senior Principal Officers, 10 for Principal Officers, and 10 for Senior Officers.

Assisting NAOG in the roll-out of the training, the Project invited professors renowned in their respective fields to lead the training for top-level managers. International professors' lecture content, delivery method and reading materials set a benchmark for NAOG professors and assisted them to modify and contextualize the modules' content. The pedagogy for the training included: Introductory, interactive lectures that set the stage for the day; interactive class discussions facilitated by the instructor – enabling the participants to think about public policy challenges from different, sometimes competing, perspectives. Details of guest lectures are provided below under Section 2.5.

Below is the progress of the roll-out of the Package of professionalization training:

- Senior principle – 93% certified. Out of 120 incumbents, 111 have completed the training.
- Principle – 87% certified. Out of 764 incumbents, 667 have completed the training.
- Senior – 13% certified. Out of 2628 incumbents, 339 have completed the training.³²

Concurrently, with the Project support, the NAOG has started to develop an online version of the mandatory modules, in a bid to increase the outreach, to provide flexibility in learning, and to allow continuous modification of the content based on the feedback from civil servants.

2.5. Lectures on key innovative public policy topics were delivered by international professors

Providing policy advice to the government is an essential function of civil servants – a duty to provide evidence-based, balanced and objective advice to policy makers. In a volatile, uncertain, confusing and ambiguous (VUCA) environment new skills are required for civil servants in defining policy problems, solutions and effective communication of policy decisions. Having identified such emerging skills and acknowledging shortage of readily available local capacity the Project has engaged professors from Asia's leading school in public policy – Lee Kuan Yew School of Public Policy (LKYSPP) of the Republic of Singapore on the following thematic areas:

- Skills of public managers;
- Policy analysis; and
- Policy communications.

A lecture on “*Skills of public managers*” was delivered by Prof.Dr. Zeger van der Wal, LKYSPP, for the top echelon of civil servants in Mongolia. He is the author of the bestselling public administration book “Seven skills of a Public manager in 21st century”. The book's copyright was purchased by the

³¹ Joint Decree No.37/33 of Chief of Cabinet Secretariat and Chair of CSC, 4 April 2019

³² Numbers reported here are from NAOG, however it differs slightly from CSC. This is an on-going data inconsistency issue, which is expected to be resolved through an integrated Human Resources Management System. Support to HRMS from the Project is a phased activity which began from 2018.

Project and was translated into Mongolian language. The official launch took place in August 2019 and was attended by 120 people from public institutions, academia, civil society and the media. The book is now being used as a textbook and reference for the Package professionalization training.

A series of lectures on “*Policy analysis and the use of data analytics and behavioral insight in public sector*” was delivered by Prof. Dr. Reuben Ng of LKYSPP, to support the introduction of a new module on policy analysis by NAOG. His lecture was enriched by his experience of leading “Smart Singapore” project implemented under the auspices of the Prime Minister of Singapore. The lectures were attended not only by the civil servants who are required to complete the package Professionalization training but also by the CEOs, CFOs of the State-Owned Enterprises (SOE). This strategy for spillover was a timely intervention as there is a rising public demand to hold SOEs accountable and be more efficient in managing state funds and resources. Although, legally, these Chief executives are not considered as civil servants, both the Cabinet Secretariat and the CSC agreed on the importance engaging SOEs in the Civil service reform process and exposing them to innovative tools for bringing public value.

A series of lectures on “*Policy communication*” was delivered by Prof. James Crabtree of LKYSPP. With the rise of new media, policy makers are required to be more effective in communicating policy options both to the political masters and the public. Hence, “Policy communication” module is new not only to NAOG but also to public policy schools globally. Topics covered under this module include: *Shaping public policy: the rise of new media and political change; Dealing with media: agenda setting, framing and media’s impact*. Drawing from his experience as an advisor to UK Prime Minister’s Strategy Unit, Prof. Crabtree engaged with media to dissect and discuss issues of wicked policy problems, role of media, and dilemmas – using reflections from Brexit as a case study.

These sessions facilitated the CSC to engage in a non-traditional policy dialogue with the media. Feedback from the media was encouragingly positive, press officers from Ministries requesting another round of such discussions. A spin-off effect – a group of 10 aspiring journalists have formed an online Facebook group to share and further specialize in covering public issues.

2.6. Ethics management in public sector

A new mandate was granted to CSC as per Art 66.1 of the CSL to provide advice and methodological guidance to civil servants in managerial and executive positions on observing the ethical norms. The Code of Ethics for Administrative and Service category Civil Servants was approved in January 2019. The Project assisted in dissemination of the Code to 46 Ethics Councils and raising awareness of the newly introduced requirements.

At the end of 2019, CSC had consolidated reports on breaches of ethical norms of service and administration categories, as opposed to just on the administrative category. The report along with the proposal for further measures will be submitted to the Standing Committee on State Structure in March 2020. While not formalized, breaches of ethical norms were down by 21% from 2018. Through its Ethical Councils, CSC was able to disaggregate the ethical breaches by institutions, types, significance and the types of measures taken on breaches. This data will give insight to CSC and other stakeholders, especially Independent Agency Against-Corruption (IAAC) on how to strategize its intervention on prevention of ethical breaches and corruption.

The IAAC has scaled-up two Project supported deliverables of 2018 through its internal budget in 2019 – by printing and using ethics and conflict of interest training manuals during their planned trainings in the regions³³. These two manuals have supported the implementation of the National

³³ <https://iaac.mn/files/6e396b8e-a4cd-41d6-8a42-535892425542/2019%20Tailan.pdf>

Anti-Corruption Strategy and an outreach of 1,400 civil servants from different categories. Feedback from trainings and strategic discussion with CSC, IAAC acknowledges the need for targeting the training towards sectors, professional and position clusters – procurement, finance, accounting etc. a shift from generalized training to a more targeted approach is largely driven by the voices from the participants who conveyed commonalities in the dilemma and the challenges faced by civil servants by sectors, and professions.

Output 3. Enhanced gender equality in public administration

Indicator(s):	Baseline:	Targets:	Update for 2019 (Year 2):
3.1 Increased representation of women in senior administrative posts.	8.3% (2016)	10% increase (Y4)	Due to be updated in Apr 2020, when the census completes
3.2 Number of senior managers received gender-sensitization training.	0	60 (Y1) 60 (Y2) 60 (Y3) 180 (Y4)	On track (all senior managers in 16 aimags received gender training)
3.3 A mechanism in place to monitor the implementation of the gender quota in the civil service.	0	1 (Y1) 1 (Y1) 1 (Y1) 1 (Y1)	On track (NHRC conducted monitoring of the Law on Gender Equality in 16 aimags)
3.4 Number of women benefited from leadership and networking programmes.	0	100 (Y1) 500 (Y2) 200 (Y3) 200 (Y4) 1000 (cumulative)	Training for women's leadership is included in 2020 AWP

3.1. Gender equality and human rights awareness raising trainings and inspections were carried out

In 2018, the civil service human resource managers' Training of Trainers was conducted by the National Human Rights Commission of Mongolia (NHRC) to create a national network of trainers on gender and human rights. In 2019, a gender and human rights training was held for heads of public organizations and senior civil servants in 11 aimags, with Project support. The topics of the training include principles of human rights, human rights-based approaches; basic concepts and theories of gender equality; gender-based discrimination; gender-based violence; gender related grievance process; core provisions of the Law on Gender Equality of Mongolia; and gender perspective in public organizations.

The total number of participants of the gender and human rights was over 500, of which over 60% were women. The total number of participants was well beyond the planned 30 people per aimag (or 330), as aimag authorities wanted to have as many staff as possible trained. The public organizations they represent include aimag secondary schools, vocational training centres, Court, Police, Meteorology Agency, Standardization Office, Environment Department, Specialized Inspection Department, Social Insurance Office, Health Department, Agriculture Department, Prosecutor's Office, and aimag Emergency Department.

The training assessment report revealed that the training was very well received by the participants and greatly contributed to their general knowledge and understanding of gender equality and human

rights in the civil service. Most participants also proposed to have similar trainings for all staff and emphasized the need for regular trainings³⁴.

The training assessment report also gathered valuable suggestions for improving the training content and mode of delivery in the future. The feedback of participants was constructive, practical, and genuine. They suggested to use cases and examples to illustrate the point and to make it easier to compare and contrast; use more group works; take examples of most likely breaches and ways to address them; allocate more time for dialogue and discussions; refer to obligations and duties as well when speaking about rights.

NHRC monitoring/inspection on the implementation of the Law on Gender Equality was also carried out in the above 11 aimags. In each of the aimags the following 10 public administration institutions were inspected:

- Aimag Governor's Office;
- Aimag centre Soum Governor's Office;
- Secretariat of the Aimag Citizens' Representative Khural (local council);
- Secretariat of the Soum Citizens' Representative Khural (local council);
- Aimag Specialized Inspection Agency;
- Aimag Department of Education, Culture and Arts;
- Aimag Social Insurance Office;
- Aimag Labor and Welfare Service;
- Aimag Department of Health;
- Vocational Training and Production Center/Polytechnic College

The scope of the monitoring/inspection included, among others, the status of gender parity disaggregated by different categories of civil service.

Trainings held or actions taken on gender, amount of budgets allocated for gender related activities, review of internal procedures and decrees and decisions to reveal any gender-based discrimination, and existence and status of gender related complaints handling mechanism. For example, the NHRC report shows in some aimags women's participation is quite high, even at the decision-making level.

“In 2018, of the total of 5,212 civil servants of the aimag, 72.7% were women and 27.3% were men; women held 57.6% of decision-making positions and 78.4% of staff level posts.”

Common areas of non-compliance with the Gender Equality Law that the NHRC inspection brought to the attention of heads of public organizations were lack of sex disaggregated data, the provisions of the GEL, such as workplace harassment, not reflected in the organizational internal rules, and dismissals while on maternity leave. The NHRC provided on-the-spot guidance and advice to the subject institutions, in addition to issuing formal recommendations obliging them to take remedial actions where breaches had been revealed.

A detailed questionnaire was distributed to staff during the NHRC to identify if how they would rate their understanding on gender-based discrimination, workplace harassment and sexual harassment, and if they know whom to contact if they witness any of these.

From the results of the detailed survey, the NHRC noticed that aimags where gender and human rights trainings had been held in the past year, showed much better results. This is also in line with the Gender Baseline study in the Administrative Civil Service finding that the gender equality awareness was higher in aimags than in central ministries and agencies. While there may have been other gender trainings held in aimags, the Project supported trainings did significantly

³⁴ Field trip report on Monitoring of the Law on Gender Equality, NHRC, 2019

contribute to the overall gender and human rights awareness among aimag civil servants, which were again substantiated by the detailed survey by the NHRC.

The gender data generated by the NHRC inspection will constitute a baseline for aimag level public organizations and will be used for tracking the progress at the organizational level.

The Project staff attended GAC/Canadian Embassy gender training in September 2019, focusing on mainstreaming gender in project activities. The gender advisor of the UNDP Bangkok Regional Hub (BRH) visited the CSC in September 2019, to exchange views on gender mainstreaming in the civil service and pointed out to areas where proactive actions are usually needed, including training of female civil servants after maternity leave to provide equal opportunity for career advancement. UNDP management also highlighted the leadership role of the CSC in promoting gender equality in the civil service at several meeting occasions that took place in 2019.

3.2. Advocacy on prevention from sexual harassment was carried out using postcard type illustrations

In November 2019, Mongolian society became aware of a case of harassment on a plane to South Korea involving a Mongolian high-level public official. Taking opportunity of the momentum where the issue was at the centre of public attention, the NHRC with the Project support, disseminated advocacy postcards to all public institutions, calling for an end to sexual and workplace harassment and showcasing damage made to the victim. The postcards, which contained disturbing image compared to previously produced advocacy items were delivered directly to heads of organizations, in order to prompt immediate behavior changes.

3.3. A baseline study on gender equality in administrative civil service was conducted

This section was covered under *Output 1. Strengthened legal and policy framework for a professional civil service*, section 1.2. However, further work on gender equality in public administration will be reported under *Output 3*.

Output 4. Citizen-centred monitoring of public administration performance

Indicator(s):	Baseline:	Targets:	Update for 2019 (Year 2):
4.1 Number of government agencies adopted a standard procedure for performance appraisals.	0	2 (Y2) 10 (Y3) 11 (Y4)	The common procedure to performance appraisal was adopted by the Government
4.2 Number of government agencies developed strategic and annual business plans.	0	40 (Y4)	
4.3 A methodology for citizen monitoring of performance of public service agencies adopted as part of the government M&E system.	1	1 (Y2)	The methodology will be drafted in 2020, based on stocktaking of available methodologies being applied in Mongolia

4.1. Strategic planning methodology is being piloted

A major conceptual change introduced by the revised CSL is the introduction of strategic, business and performance plans for public organizations and civil servants. The Procedures on developing these plans was approved in January 2019, and the project has provided support to development of methodologies for implementing these procedures.

The Monitoring, Evaluation and Internal Audit Department of the Cabinet Secretariat, has been taking the lead. It conducted trainings in selected central and sub-national government agencies, explaining the methodology and piloted several templates.

Despite extensive trainings, public organizations found it difficult to develop a strategic plan on their own. Also, templates for reporting were found by public organizations and civil servants as time-consuming and complicated.

The methodological approach to strategic planning, including templates, is currently being analysed in order to strengthen its conceptual basis and to position it as a tool that drives public organizations towards results-based management, making a shift from activity-based planning and input-based budgeting to output-outcome based planning, budgeting, monitoring and reporting. In particular, the strategic plan of the Ministry of Finance, supported by the World Bank, was reviewed for the purpose of improving the planning methodology. The results-based management and strategic planning initiatives of the Mineral Resources and Petroleum Authority of Mongolia (MRPAM), supported by MERIT project has also been identified for this purpose.

Activities related to the performance appraisal system and participatory monitoring of public sector performance have not started yet, pending the development of competency framework and the finalization of the strategic plan outcome indicators and targets.

4. Project management

The Project Implementation Unit (PIU) is located at the CSC Office, and consists of: a National Project Manager, a Senior Technical Advisor, a Monitoring and Evaluation Officer (part time), an Administrative and Finance Officer and a Driver.

A Project Board was established in 2018 to provide guidance and strategic direction for the implementation of the project. The Board meetings were held quarterly in 2018 and 2019.

In 2019, the total annual budget approved was \$ 1,604,880. The actual expenditure of the Project was \$ 1,253,931, with financial delivery rate of 78%. Some activities planned for 2019 were delayed due to the challenge of developing methodologies, rules and regulations while concurrently having to rollout the implementation, which stretched the available human resources. Better planning will prevent many of these bottlenecks. Efforts will be made to improve the delivery rate of the project.

All procurement activities were undertaken in accordance with Mongolia's Law on Public Procurement and UNDP Programme and Operations Policies and Procedures (POPP). Regular financial reports on project expenditure were submitted to and approved by UNDP operations. The audit for 2018 (national implementation modality) provided an "unqualified" opinion.

National ownership and institutionalization. The Project office is located in the CSC building; the office space rental and maintenance costs covered by the CSC as in-kind contribution. Being in the same office allows the Project to interact with the CSC management and staff on a daily basis, and coordinate activities.

The Project annual workplan assigns respective government entities as responsible parties for undertaking and completion of specific outputs and activities. Under this arrangement, the government entities hire consultants, organize trainings, conduct studies, and provide reports upon completion. Those specific activities also constitute part of their own organizational plan, annual reports, thereby, enhancing sustainability and capacity-building. For example, NHRC includes the findings of its monitoring of the Law on Gender Equality in its annual Report on Status of Human Rights and Freedom in Mongolia.

Engaging closely with the government counterparts also allows leveraging on comparative advantages of the national system or infrastructure. The workshop of CSC Chapters in December 2019 was held at the University of Internal Affairs, which significantly reduced venue rental and refreshment related costs.

The number of participants directly engaged in the Project supported trainings and workshops for 2019 was 4,354, of which around 34% were women, and 66% men.

Greening. The Project has been taken actions to reduce environmental impact of its activities by using recyclable water bottles, minimizing plastic and paper prints, and refraining from single use workshop consumables. UNDP Country Office is developing further contextualized guidelines to be applied by all projects and to better inform counterparts of its policy³⁵.

³⁵ <https://www.undp.org/content/undp/en/home/accountability/social-and-environmental-responsibility.html>

Financial status as of December 2019 (US\$).

<i>by Outputs</i>	<i>2018-Disbursed</i>	<i>2019-Disbursed</i>	<i>Total</i>
Output 1	533,820	310,995	844,814
Output 2	131,871	680,752	812,623
Output 3	81,067	54,855	135,922
Output 4	57,092	51,477	108,570
Project management	112,191	155,853	268,045
Total	916,042	1,253,932	2,169,974

Updated status of multi-year allocation

Total budget as per the Project Document	5,500,000
Total disbursement (2018, 2019)	2,169,974
Planned disbursement for 2020	1,388,016
Total expected disbursement at the end of 2020	3,557,990
Exchange rate gain and loss	-62,348
Funds remaining for 2021 and 2022	1,879,662

5. Update on risks and issues

#	Description/ risk category	Date identified; Probability/ Impact	Owner/ Counter measures/ Management response	Date of update/ Status
1	The new CSL was approved in 2017. Depending on the result of the 2020 elections, a new government in power may decide to revise the law again. Risk category - political	Jan 2018 High/ High	Parliament of Mongolia In the third year, the project will undertake a study to evaluate the effectiveness of the implementation of the CSL and provide a more evidence-based framework for debates on the issues and options to solve them, thus contribute to building of a consensus.	Dec 2019 High/ High Both the risk and the counter measures remain active and in effect. Reform related advocacy activities planned for 2020 are to incorporate evidences of effectiveness of implementation and facilitate consensus building at the political level.
2	Civil service reforms do not address the root causes of current problems Risk category - strategic	Jan 2018 High/ High	CSC The options paper and data analysis will highlight options for solutions and increase the likelihood that good reform solutions are identified	Dec 2019 High/ High Technical solutions are being implemented, to support the mitigation of root causes that are political (risk #1). Analysis 2019 implementation data to be conducted in the first half of 2020.
3	The new CSL has introduced many elements such as strategic and performance planning/management in public organizations, reform of examination for the civil service, professionalization training programme. Because of lack of knowledge and prior experience, they may hamper effective implementation of the law Risk category - organizational	Jan 2018 High/ Medium	UNDP The project includes activities to address this problem by supporting studies of international best practices and experiences, making available modern textbooks, and recruitment of short-term international for specific tasks and recruitment of a full-time national senior technical adviser.	Dec 2019 High/ Medium Short term international consultants have been recruited for specific tasks; national technical adviser has been recruited; textbooks on strategic management, civil service leadership, ethics management have been translated; study visits have provided insights into international good practices on specific topics;
4	Capacity-building is ineffective because civil servants who are trained are dismissed after the 2020 elections. Risk category – operational, organizational	Jan 2018 High/ High	UNDP The project integrates policy and institutional reform, capacity building, recognizing the interdependence between these components	Dec 2019 High / Medium Mandatory professionalization training has been introduced; career-based promotion provides some safeguards;
5	The spread of COVID-19 virus and restraints imposed on public events may delay the project implementation. Parliamentary elections in June 2020 may also slow down project activities.	Feb 2010 High/ Medium	UNDP/CSC The project will speed up the development of online materials and encourage online meetings. Stakeholder WG to address this risk will be established.	Feb 2020

6. Lessons learned and way forward for 2020

Enhancing continuous public support for the civil service reform. In the first two years of the project implementation, the focus was on raising awareness among civil servants of the new operating environment under the CSL. For 2020, more efforts will be put for engaging the public - a key stakeholder in the reform process. Acknowledging their power and support, the Project intends to raise awareness among the public of the reform concept and the principles set forth in the law through effective communications strategies such as the rallying of thoughts leaders among others.

Improved knowledge sharing. Study tour participants learn a great deal during the overseas trainings or workshops. So, the Project will undertake structured activities, such as knowledge sharing workshops among civil servants of partner organizations, to further disseminate the findings and stimulate debates on potential solutions. A working paper series will be produced based on re-packaging of study tour reports and other research materials and guest lecturers' presentations. Such papers will be uploaded onto the website for broader audience.

Promoting online trainings and audio-video meetings. In the first two years, all trainings and conferences organized by the Project with government counterparts were classroom trainings where physical presence of participants was required. For 2020, the Project will promote use of online conferencing tools, and will assign some workshops to be held only online.

Ensuring synergies and coherence among various components of civil service reform. The Project will initiate and create cross-subject technical working groups to enhance coherence of different streams of work, including job descriptions, competency framework, testing, HR related processes, performance management, pay scales, organizational strategic planning etc

Ensuring synergy with MERIT and other projects working in governance and civil service-related projects to promote mutual learning and efficient use of resources. The Project will organize quarterly technical meetings addressing areas of complementarity, including competency development, strategic planning, and gender equality. UNDP will also coordinate with MERIT in linking their activities at the sub-national level.

Annex

List of trainings and workshops

#	Date	Training, workshops, events	Government organizations	Participants		
				Total	Male	Female
1	16, 17 Feb	Taskforce discussion assigned to revise CSL procedures: "Generic and special examination", "Career based promotion", "Establishing civil service reserve"	CSC staff and consultants	27	17	10
					63%	37%
2	19-Feb	Meeting of public managers	State Secretaries, Heads of agencies, Heads of 21 aimags' Governor's offices, CSC	86	71	15
					82.50%	17.50%
3	21, 22 Feb	Consultative meeting of public managers at sub-national level	Governors and Heads of Governor's offices of 21 aimag, 330 soum and 21 districts, and Cabinet Secretariat staff	591	410	181
					69.30%	30.60%
4	16-Mar	Package professionalization training: Policies and Strategies, Ethics and Human rights, IT Policies	State secretaries, heads of agencies, heads of policy coordination and heads of strategy unit of ministries, agencies and municipal offices	63	54	9
					85.70%	14.30%
5	22-Mar	Package professionalization training: 7 skills of a 21st century public manager	CSC, aimag, Ulaanbaatar Governor's office, and implementing agencies of Ulaanbaatar city	70	58	12
					82.90%	17.10%
6	5, 6 Apr	Consultation "Legal reform: Civil service law"	CSC	30	17	13
					56.70%	43.30%
7	15-Apr	NUM event 'UB Impulse'	Civil servants, academia	150		
8	29-Apr	Workshop on status of bylaws, procedures of the CSL	CSC staff and consultants	35	18	17
					51.50%	48.50%
9	5-7 May	Package professionalization training: Policies and Strategies, Ethics and Human rights, IT Policies	Heads of PA departments of Ministries, Agencies, Heads of 21 aimag and district Governor's offices, Heads of secretariats of CRHs	405	278	127
					68.64%	31.36%
10	5,6 May	Workshop on bylaws, procedures and executive orders of CSL	Heads of PA departments of Ministries, Agencies, Heads of 21 aimag and district Governor's offices, Heads of secretariats of CRHs	110	85	25
					77.30%	22.70%
11	3,4 May	Conference on public sector ethics	Public managers, academia, CSO	305	225	80
					73.80%	26,2%
12	24-May	Workshop on "Implementation issues related to CSL's HRM related bylaws, procedures"	Heads of public administration units in sub-national level, senior HR managers, heads of secretariat of CRHs	108	76	32
					70.40%	29.60%
13	8-11 Jun	Package professionalization training: Policies and Strategies, Ethics and Human rights, IT Policies	President's office, Supreme court, Judicial Council, General Prosecutor's office, institutions which report to the Parliament.	290	205	85
					70.70%	29.30%

14	4-Jun	Package professionalization training: Policies and Strategies, Ethics and Human rights, IT Policies	Cabinet Secretariat staff, CSC, Heads of Legal department of ministries and agencies	124	86	38
					69.40%	30.60%
15	26-Jun	Consultative meeting "Civil service reform and stakeholder participation"	CSC, CSC Secretariat, CSC Chapters of Ulaanbaatar city	52	29	23
					55.80%	44.20%
16	26, 27 Aug	Workshop on developing job descriptions for the aimag JD Working Groups	JD Working Groups established at 21 aimags, municipal offices	112	50	62
					44.70%	55.30%
17	30-Aug	Launch of the book "21st Century Public manager" - translation	CSC, CSC Secretariat, State Secretaries, Heads of Agencies, Cabinet Secretariat, academia	110	63	47
					57%	43%
18	18-20 Sep	Workshop on HRM practice in South Korean civil service by Ministry of Personnel Management of Republic of Korea	CSC and the Cabinet Secretariat	30	18	12
					60%	40%
19	25-28 Sep	Package professionalization training: Policies and Strategies, Ethics and Human rights, IT Policies	Governors offices heads, Heads of Secretariats of CRHs	305	201	104
					66%	34%
20	27-Sep	Public policy communications - Media event	Press officers of ministries and agencies	130	58	72
					45%	55%
21	16-Oct	NUM 'UB Impulse'	Civil servants, academia	170	109	61
					64%	36%
22	13-15 Nov, 18-20 Nov	Human resources audit training - Fundamentals	CSC Secretariat and HR managers, legal specialist of central government	23	11	12
					48%	52%
23	28-Nov	NUM 'UB Impulse'	Civil servants, academia	150	67	83
					45%	55%
24	5-Dec	Workshop on HRM practice in South Korean civil service by Ministry of Personnel Management of Republic of Korea	State Secretaries, Heads of agencies, lecturers of NAOG	108	66	42
					61%	39%
25	9, 10 Dec	Consultative meeting of CSC Chapters	CSC, CSC Secretariat, Heads of CSC Chapters	310	198	112
					64%	36%
26	10-Dec	Workshop on "Implementation of the Gender equality law"	CSC, CSC Secretariat, Heads of CSC Chapters	310	198	112
					64%	36%
27	16-Dec	Roundtable discussion "Ethics, accountability and discipline of civil servants"	State secretaries, heads of agencies, heads of institutions under the parliament	100	89	11
					89%	11%
28	19-Dec	Public consultation of the Procedure of the Public Oversight Council	CSC, private sector, CSO, iNGO	50	31	19
					62%	38%
	TOTAL			4,354	2,874 (66%)	1,480 (34%)

List of field trips

#	Purpose and destination	Date	Number of participants (number of staff dispatched only; the number of local participants is more than 100 for each of the aimags)
1	CSC field trips on CSL advocacy, training and methodological guidance		
	Dundgobi, Umnugobi aimags	11-16 Jun 2019	5
	Zavkhan, Khuvsgul aimags	10-18 Jun	4
	Khovd, Bayan-ulgii, Uvs aimags	9-21 Jun 2019	4
	Selenge, Darkhan-uul, Orkhon aimags	9-15 Jun 2019	4
	Bayankhongor, Gobi-altai, Uvurkhangai aimags	12-18 Jun 2019	4
	Dornod aimag	17-23 Aug 2019	3
	Arkhangai aimag	15-18 Sep 2019	4
	Khentii, Sukhbaatar aimags	15-21 Sep 2019	4
	Dornogobi, Gobi-sumber aimags	21-26 Sep 2019	4
	Bulgan aimag	15-18 Oct 2019	6
Tuv aimag	17-19 Oct 2019	4	
2	CSC field trips on preparation and methodological guidance for undertaking civil service entry examination – all aimags	14-18 Nov 2019	24
3	NHRC field trips on gender sensitization and monitoring of the Law on Gender Equality		
	Uvurkhangai, Bayankhongor, Gobi-altai aimags	31 Mar–10 Apr 2019	5
	Selenge, Orkhon, Darkhan-uul aimags	22-30 May 2019	6
	Umnugobi, Dundgobi aimags	16-21 Jun 2019	7
	Khentii, Sukhbaatar, Dornod aimags	18-28 Sep 2019	8
	Zavkhan, Arkhangai aimags	17-22 Nov 2019	6
	Tuv aimag	28-29 Nov 2019	7/5
Khuvsgul, Bulgan aimags	1-7 Dec 2019	8	
4	Cabinet Secretariat field trips on strategic planning methodology and procedures		
	Uvs aimag (participants from Uvs, Zavkhan, Bayan-ulgii, Khovd, Gobi-altai)	17-22 Jun 2019	14
	Arkhangai aimag (participants from Arkhangai, Khuvsgul, Orkhon, Uvurkhangai)	26-30 Jun 2019	15
	Khentii, Dornod, Sukhbaatar aimags	16-21 Sep 2019	9
	Tuv aimag	17-19 Oct 2019	7
Dornogobi aimag (participants from Dornogobi, Umnugobi, Dundgobi, Gobi-sumber))	13-16 Nov 2019	8	